The Honorable James L. Robart 1 2 3 4 5 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 6 FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE 7 8 MICROSOFT CORPORATION, a Washington corporation, CASE NO. C10-1823-JLR 9 Plaintiff, ORDER DENYING MICROSOFT'S 10 MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT **OF INVALIDITY** 11 v. [PROPOSED] 12 MOTOROLA, INC., and MOTOROLA NOTED ON MOTION CALENDAR: MOBILITY, INC., and GENERAL Friday, April 13, 2012 13 INSTRUMENT CORPORATION, 14 Defendants. 15 16 This matter came before the Court on Microsoft's Corporation's Motion for Summary 17 Judgment of Invalidity. 18 The Court has considered the following pleadings: 19 Microsoft's Corporation's Motion for Summary Judgment of Invalidity; 1. 20 2. Declaration of Douglas I. Lewis in Support of Microsoft Corporation's Motion for 21 Summary Judgment of Invalidity and the exhibits thereto; 22 Motorola's Opposition to Microsoft Corporation Motion for Summary Judgment of 3. 23 Invalidity; and 24 4. Declaration of Timothy Drabik and Exhibits A-M attached thereto; 25 26 ORDER DENYING MICROSOFT'S MOTION FOR SUMMIT LAW GROUP PLLC

SUMMARY JUDGMENT OF INVALIDITY - 1 CASE NO. C10-1823-JLR

315 FIFTH AVENUE SOUTH, SUITE 1000 SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104-2682 Telephone: (206) 676-7000 Fax: (206) 676-7001

Case 2:10-cv-01823-JLR Document 251-1 Filed 04/06/12 Page 2 of 4

1	Having considered the above pleadings and materials, the argument of counsel, and being		
2	otherwise fully advised, the Court hereby		
3	ORDERS, ADJUDGES AND DECREES that Microsoft's Motion for Summary Judgmen		
4	of Invalidity is DENIED.		
5	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
6	DATED this day of	, 2012.	
7			
8		THE HONORABLE JAMES L. ROBART UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE	
9 10	Presented by:		
11	SUMMIT LAW GROUP PLLC		
13	By <u>/s/ Ralph H. Palumbo</u> Ralph H. Palumbo, WSBA #04751 Philip S. McCune, WSBA #21081		
15 16	Lynn M. Engel, WSBA #21934 philm@summitlaw.com lynne@summitlaw.com ralphp@summitlaw.com		
17			
18	By <u>/s/ K. McNeill Taylor, Jr.</u> K. McNeill Taylor, Jr.		
19	MOTOROLA MOBILITY, INC. MD W4-150		
20	600 North U.S. Highway 45 Libertyville, IL 60048-1286		
21	Phone: 858-404-3580 Fax: 847-523-0727		
22	Tux. 017 323 0727		
23			
24			
25			
26			

ORDER DENYING MICROSOFT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OF INVALIDITY - 2 CASE NO. C10-1823-JLR

SUMMIT LAW GROUP PLLC
315 FIFTH AVENUE SOUTH, SUITE 1000
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104-2682
Telephone: (206) 676-7000
Fax: (206) 676-7001

Jesse J. Jenner (pro hac vice) Steven Pepe (pro hac vice) Stuart W. Yothers (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1211 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036-8704 (212) 596-9046 jesse.jenner@ropesgray.com steven.pepe@ropesgray.com Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com 10 Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 14 One Metro Center 15 One Metro Center 16 One Metro Center 17 One Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Stuart W. Yothers (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1211 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036-8704 (212) 596-9046 jesse.jenner@ropesgray.com steven.pepe@ropesgray.com Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com 10 gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com 11 Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Ropes & Gray LLP 1211 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036-8704 (212) 596-9046	
12 11 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036-8704 (212) 596-9046 jesse.jenner@ropesgray.com steven.pepe@ropesgray.com Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com 10 Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
New York, NY 10036-8704 (212) 596-9046 jesse.jenner@ropesgray.com steven.pepe@ropesgray.com Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
5 (212) 596-9046	
jesse.jenner@ropesgray.com steven.pepe@ropesgray.com stuart.yothers@ropesgray.com Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
steven.pepe@ropesgray.com Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com 2 Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Norman H. Beamer (pro hac vice) Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Gabrielle E. Higgins (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Ropes & Gray LLP 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com 11	
9 1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com 11 gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com 12 Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 14 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
10 (650) 617-4030 norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com 12 Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 14 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
norman.beamer@ropesgray.com gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
11 gabrielle.higgins@ropesgray.com 12 Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 14 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Paul M. Schoenhard (pro hac vice) Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Kevin J. Post (pro hac vice) Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Ropes & Gray LLP One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
One Metro Center 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
700 12th Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005-3948	
Washington, DC 20005-3948	
15 (202) 508-4693	
paul.schoenhard@ropesgray.com kevin.post@ropesgray.com	
16 kevin.post@ropesgray.com	
17 Attorneys for Motorola Solutions, Inc., Moto	rola
18 Mobility, Inc., and General Instrument Corp	•
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
24	
25	
23	
26	

ORDER DENYING MICROSOFT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OF INVALIDITY - 3 CASE NO. C10-1823-JLR

SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104-2682 Telephone: (206) 676-7000 Fax: (206) 676-7001

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE 1 I hereby certify that on this day I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the 2 Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following: 3 Arthur W. Harrigan, Jr., Esq. 4 Christopher T. Wion, Esq. Shane P. Cramer, Esq. 5 Danielson, Harrigan, Leyh & Tollefson LLP arthurh@dhlt.com 6 chrisw@dhlt.com shanec@dhlt.com 7 Brian R. Nester, Esq. 8 David T. Pritikin, Esq. Douglas I. Lewis, Esq. 9 John W. McBride, Esq. Richard A. Cederoth, Esq. 10 David Greenfield, Esq. 11 William H. Baumgartner, Jr., Esq. David C. Giardina, Esq. 12 Carter G. Phillips, Esq. Constantine L. Trela, Jr., Esq. 13 Ellen S. Robbins, Esq. Sidley Austin LLP 14 bnester@sidley.com dpritikin@sidley.com 15 dilewis@sidlev.com jwmcbride@sidley.com 16 rcederoth@sidley.com david.greenfield@sidley.com 17 wbaumgartner@sidley.com dgiardina@sidley.com 18 cphillips@sidley.com ctrela@sidley.com 19 erobbins@sidley.com 20 T. Andrew Culbert, Esq. 21 David E. Killough, Esq. Microsoft Corp. 22 andycu@microsoft.com davkill@microsoft.com 23 DATED this 6th day of April, 2012. 24 25 /s/ Marcia A. Ripley Marcia A. Ripley 26

ORDER DENYING MICROSOFT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OF INVALIDITY - 4 CASE NO. C10-1823-JLR

SUMMIT LAW GROUP PLLC

315 FIFTH AVENUE SOUTH, SUITE 1000 SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104-2682 Telephone: (206) 676-7000 Fax: (206) 676-7001